

SHEFFIELD CITY COUNCIL

Planning and Highways Committee

Meeting held 6 December 2022

PRESENT: Councillors Dianne Hurst (Joint Chair), Mike Chaplin, Tony Damms, Roger Davison, Brian Holmshaw, Barbara Masters, Bob McCann, Peter Price, Alan Woodcock, Tom Hunt (Substitute Member) and Richard Williams (Substitute Member)

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

- 1.1 Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Nighat Basharat, Garry Weatherall and Cliff Woodcraft.
- 1.2 Councillor Tom Hunt acted as substitute for Councillor Weatherall.
- 1.3 Councillor Richard Williams acted as substitute for Councillor Woodcraft.

2. EXCLUSION OF PUBLIC AND PRESS

- 2.1 No items were identified where resolutions may be moved to exclude the press and public.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

- 3.1 Councillor Richard Williams declared a personal interest in Agenda Item 9f, Planning Application No. 22/02840/FUL - Garage Site At Rear Of 23 To 31 Hanson Road, Sheffield, S6 6RF, as a local ward member. Councillor Woodcock declared that he had received representations from neighbours of the site and had made comment. He would take no part in the voting thereon.

4. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

- 4.1 Councillor Holmshaw informed the Committee that he had moved that the application at Minute No. 8e be deferred due to local residents and Members not being notified of the date of the meeting, rather than not being consulted.
- 4.2 **RESOLVED:-** that, subject to Minute No. 8e.1 being amended to read '*Councillor Brian Holmshaw moved that the application should be deferred to allow local residents and ward members more time to make their representations because he stated that they had not been notified of the date of the meeting. The Officer explained to the Committee the nature of the publicity which had been carried out,*

which included direct neighbour notification to affected residents; a notice in the Sheffield Telegraph; and notices posted adjacent to the site. This is in line with the statutory requirements for publicising planning applications as well as the Council's Statement of Community Involvement and Code of Practice for publicity. The motion was not seconded, so the application proceeded to be heard',
the minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 8th November 2022 were approved as a correct record.

5. SITE VISIT

- 5.1 **RESOLVED:-** That the Chief Planning Officer, in liaison with a Co-Chair, be authorised to make any arrangements for a site visit, in connection with any planning applications requiring a visit by Members, prior to the next meeting of the Committee.

6. TREE PRESERVATION ORDER NO. 456 - CARTMELL HILL, WOODSEATS, S8 0RG

- 6.1 Vanessa Lyons (Community Tree Officer) attended the meeting and presented the report.
- 6.2 An email had been received from a local Councillor with a request from a member of the public that the tree be protected as adjacent trees had recently been removed or inexpertly pruned.
- 6.3 The Community Tree Officer had visited the site and carried out a TEMPO assessment which had identified the tree as suitable for protection.
- 6.4 No objections had been received.
- 6.5 **RESOLVED:-** That Tree Preservation Order No. 456 be confirmed unmodified.

7. TREE PRESERVATION ORDER NO. 457 - QUARRY HILL COTTAGE, WOOD ROYD ROAD, DEEPCAR, S36 2TA

- 7.1 Vanessa Lyons (Community Tree Officer) attended the meeting and presented the report.
- 7.2 A Landscape Officer within the Council had requested that trees on the site be assessed for suitability for protection, following receipt of a pre-application on the site.
- 7.3 The Community Tree Officer had visited the site and carried out a TEMPO assessment which had identified 3 sycamore trees as suitable for protection.

7.4 One objection had been received to the protection of T3 due to its proximity to the footprint of one of the proposed buildings and to overhead powerlines. It was noted that the tree was offered no other protection and the pre-application had now been shelved. Pruning would be carried out periodically by Northern Power.

7.5 **RESOLVED:-** That Tree Preservation Order No. 457 be confirmed unmodified.

8. APPLICATIONS UNDER VARIOUS ACTS/REGULATIONS

8a. DEFERRED FROM LAST MEETING - PLANNING APPLICATION NO. 22/00491/OUT - 9 - 11 WOOD ROYD ROAD, SHEFFIELD, S36 2TA

8a.1 The Chair explained that this was a continuation of the application from the previous meeting at which she had not been present and that only those Members who were present at the previous meeting could take part in the debate and vote.

8a.2 The Chair and Councillors Bob McCann, Peter Price, Tom Hunt and Richard Williams left the meeting.

8a.3 Councillor Alan Woodcock took the Chair.

8a.4 An additional representation, along with the officer response and corrections to the list of conditions from the previous meeting plus further representations, along with the officer response received since the last meeting were included within the supplementary report circulated and summarised at the meeting.

8a.5 Following a summary of the application, presented at the last meeting prior to its deferral, the Officer resumed Members questions in relation to flooding and highway safety matters. Officers from Highways and the Lead Local Flood Authority were also present to answer Member questions.

8a.6 The Committee considered the report and recommendation having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report and supplementary report, now submitted and also had regard to representations made during the previous meeting and responses to questions from Highways and the Lead Local Flood Authority.

8a.7 **RESOLVED:** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally subject to Legal Agreement, for the reasons set out in the report and supplementary report, now submitted, for outline planning application (all matters reserved except for access) for the partial demolition of the western gable of former farmhouse, retention of 2- storey barn, demolition of single-storey ancillary buildings, erection of up to 41 dwellinghouses, formation of vehicular access point and provision of open space and landscape buffer (Resubmission of application 19/03890/OUT) at 9 - 11 Wood Royd Road, Sheffield, S36 2TA (Application No. 22/00491/OUT).

8b. PLANNING APPLICATION NO. 20/03766/OUT - LAND AT AND ADJACENT MEADOWHALL CENTRE, MEADOWHALL WAY, SHEFFIELD ROAD AND VULCAN ROAD, M1 DISTRIBUTION CENTRE, VULCAN ROAD AND THE SOURCE, 300 MEADOWHALL WAY, SHEFFIELD, S9 1EQ

8b.1 Councillor Dianne Hurst re-took the Chair and Councillors Bob McCann, Peter Price, Tom Hunt and Richard Williams returned to the meeting.

8b.2 Councillor Tony Damms entered the meeting.

8b.3 A late representation, along with the officer response, an update to the S. 106 Heads of Terms and updates to the list of conditions were included within the supplementary report circulated and summarised at the meeting.

8b.4 Verbal clarification was given at the meeting in respect of the wording of the fourth paragraph of page 183 of the agenda papers which should be amended to read as follows:

Overall, taking all relevant factors into account, in terms of the health of existing centres and the potential impact of the proposed development, as set out in the report above, and subject to the impact mitigation proposed by the applicant being secured through appropriately worded planning conditions and obligations, it is accepted that there is no reasonable basis to conclude that the proposed development would be likely to have a significant adverse impact upon the vitality and viability of any City, Town or District Centre within the catchment areas or any existing, committed and planned public and private investment in those centres. It is consequently considered that the application is acceptable in principle and accords with the relevant Local Plan and National Planning Policy Framework policies set out at the beginning of this section.

8b.5 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues in addition to presenting photographs of the site which were provided to committee members in advance of the meeting.

8b.6 Philip Villars and Jamie Whitfield attended the meeting and spoke against the application.

8b.7 David Bloy attended the meeting and spoke in support of the application.

8b.9 The Committee considered the report and recommendation having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report and supplementary report, now submitted and also had regard to representations made during the meeting.

8b.10 **RESOLVED:** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally subject to the prior completion of a legal agreement under Section

106 of the Act based on the Heads of Terms set out in the Committee Report (as amended by the Supplementary Information) and also subject to prior consultation with the Secretary of State under the requirements of the Consultations Direction 2021, for the reasons set out in the report and supplementary report, now submitted, for outline application (all matters reserved) for the extension and/or demolition (in part or full) of existing buildings, demolition of car parking, and the provision of new built development for indoor recreation and leisure, retail, catering, offices, light industrial, creche (Use Class E), drinking establishments, hot food takeaway, cinema, police station and car showroom (Sui Generis), non-residential institution (Use Class F1), along with pedestrian and vehicular highways works, car parking (including multi-storey car park), servicing, landscaping, public realm and associated works. Permission is sought for the following description of development: Full application for the change of use of The Source from (former) Use Class D1 and D2 to indoor recreation and leisure, catering, offices, creche (Use Class E), drinking establishments, hot food takeaway (Sui Generis), and/ or non-residential institution (Use Class F1) at Land At And Adjacent Meadowhall Centre, Meadowhall Way, Sheffield Road And Vulcan Road, M1 Distribution Centre, Vulcan Road And The Source, 300 Meadowhall Way, Sheffield, S9 1EQ (Application No. 20/03766/OUT).

8c. PLANNING APPLICATION NO. 22/01692/FUL - 100A BASFORD STREET, SHEFFIELD, S9 5BJ

- 8c.1 Councillor Holmshaw was not present at the start of discussion of the application, therefore took no part in the discussion or voting thereon.
- 8c.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues in addition to presenting photographs of the site which were provided to committee members in advance of the meeting.
- 8c.3 Omar Khan, Ahmad Hayat and Councillor Mary Lea attended the meeting and spoke against the application.
- 8c.4 The Committee considered the report and recommendation having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report, now submitted and also had regard to representations made during the meeting.
- 8c.5 It was moved by Councillor Peter Price and Seconded by Councillor Roger Davison that Condition 8 regarding parking be strengthened to ensure that parking would only be permitted by those working or visiting the property. On being put to the vote, the strengthened condition was approved.
- 8c.6 It was moved by Councillor Bob McCann and seconded by Councillor Roger Davison that a directive be added to ensure that the applicant request that an H sign be added to the highway at the entrance to the property. On being put to the vote, the additional directive was approved.

8c.7 **RESOLVED:** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report, now submitted, including the additional condition and directive, for the use of dwellinghouse (Use Class C3) as residential children's home (Use Class C2) for up to 3 residents including erection of two-storey side extension, alterations to fenestration and associated works at 100A Basford Street, Sheffield, S9 5BJ (Application No. 22/01692/FUL).

8d. PLANNING APPLICATION NO. 22/03685/FUL - LAND OPPOSITE HOLME HEAD WHEEL DAM, RIVELIN VALLEY ROAD, SHEFFIELD, S6 5SF

8d.1 An amendment to condition 2 was included within the supplementary report circulated and summarised at the meeting.

8d.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues in addition to presenting photographs of the site which were provided to committee members in advance of the meeting.

8d.3 The Committee considered the report and recommendation having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report and supplementary report, now submitted.

8d.4 **RESOLVED:** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report and supplementary report, now submitted, for provision of enclosed dog walk/dog run area including 1.7m timber/wire fencing and formation of parking area (Re-submission of planning application 22/02416/FUL) at land Opposite Holme Head, Wheel Dam, Rivelin Valley Road, Sheffield, S6 5SF (Application No. 22/03685/FUL).

8e. PLANNING APPLICATION NO. 22/02768/FUL - 218 WORTLEY ROAD, HIGH GREEN, SHEFFIELD, S35 4LX

8e.1 An additional condition and 2 additional conditions were included within the supplementary report circulated and summarised at the meeting.

8e.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues in addition to presenting photographs of the site which were provided to committee members in advance of the meeting.

8e.3 Gill Ellis attended the meeting and spoke against the application.

8e.4 Daniel Bull attended the meeting and spoke in support of the application.

- 8e.5 The Committee considered the report and recommendation having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report and supplementary report, now submitted and also having regard to representations made at the meeting.
- 8e.6 It was moved by Councillor Richard Williams and seconded by Councillor Brian Holmshaw that an additional condition be added to ensure that the group of trees to be removed to facilitate the development be replaced by new trees to be planted elsewhere within the site. The Planning Officer suggested that the landscape condition be amended to include reference to replacement tree planning. On being put to the vote, the amended condition was approved.
- 8e.6 **RESOLVED:-** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report and supplementary report, including the amended condition, now submitted, for demolition of existing bungalow and erection of five detached dwellinghouses at 218 Wortley Road, High Green, Sheffield, S35 4LX (Application No. 22/02768/FUL)

8f. PLANNING APPLICATION NO. 22/02840/FUL - GARAGE SITE AT REAR OF 23 TO 31 HANSON ROAD, SHEFFIELD, S6 6RF

- 8f.1 Having previously declared his interest, Councillor Richard Williams took no part in the discussion or vote on the application.
- 8f.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues in addition to presenting photographs of the site which were provided to committee members in advance of the meeting.
- 8f.3 The Committee considered the report and recommendation having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report, now submitted.
- 8f.4 **RESOLVED:-** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report, now submitted, for use of detached, garage building as annexe to main residence at 23 Hanson Road to form external store/garden room including alterations/extension to create 1st floor level office space with first floor 3 bay window (resubmission of application 22/01897/FUL) (Amended description) at Garage Site At Rear Of 23 To 31 Hanson Road, Sheffield, S6 6RF (Application No. 22/02840/FUL)

9. RECORD OF PLANNING APPEAL SUBMISSIONS AND DECISIONS

- 9.1 The Committee received and noted a report of the Chief Planning Officer detailing planning appeals received, dismissed and allowed by the Secretary of State.

- 9.2 Officers drew Members attention to the appeal dismissed against the decision of the Committee (wrongly indicated as a delegated decision in the report) for the demolition of existing buildings and erection of 7-storey office building (Use Class E) with ground floor commercial unit (flexible retail and/or other Use Class E), with associated cycle parking at 39-43 Charles Street and 186-194 Norfolk Street, Sheffield, S1 2HU (Case No: 21/02206/FUL)
- 9.3 The Inspector agreed that the harm was less than substantial but was not outweighed by the public benefits. A reduced scheme had since been approved by the Committee.

10. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

- 10.1 The next meeting of the Planning and Highways Committee would be held on Tuesday 10th January 2023 at 2pm in the Town Hall.